

**INDIRA GANDHI NATIONAL CENTRE FOR THE ARTS**  
**Eastern Regional Centre, Varanasi.**  
**Proceedings of two-day Kalatattvakosa Samgosthi**  
**(26<sup>th</sup> – 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2008)**

---

In order to articulate Kalatattvakosa, Vol. VIII on *pratika-abhipraya*, a two-day Kalatattvakosa Samgosthi was held at ‘Parispanda’, the new office premises of Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts, Varanasi on 26<sup>th</sup> and 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2008.

The inaugural session was chaired by renowned Art-critic Prof. Rai Anand Krishna, while well-reputed art-historian and Epigraphist, Prof. K.K. Thaplyal from Lucknow graced the occasion as the chief guest. The following members were present:

1. Prof. Kamal Giri
2. Prof. Manjula Chaturvedi
3. Prof.P.K. Agrawala
4. Prof. Deenabandhu Pandey
5. Prof. Reva Prasad Dwivedi
6. Prof. Balaram Srivastava
7. Prof. Sitaram Dubey
8. Prof. Rashmikala Agrawala
9. Prof. Bishwanath Bhattacharya
10. Prof. Vimallesh Sinha
11. Prof. U.C. Dubey
12. Prof. Kamalesh Dutt Tripathi
13. Dr. Vibha Rani Dubey
14. Dr. Shitala Prasad Pandey
15. Dr. Kamalesh Jha
16. Dr. Atul Tripathi
17. Dr. Rajanikant Tripathi
18. Dr. Rama Ghose
19. Dr. Advaitavadini Kaul
20. Dr. Rachana Sharma
21. Dr. Devabrata Chaubey
22. Dr. Sukumar Chattopadhyay

23. Dr. Sadashiv Dwivedi

24. Dr. Urmila Sharma

25. Dr. Rama Dubey

26. Dr. Pranati Ghosal and all the other staff members of IGNCA, Varanasi.

The inaugural session of the two-day Seminar opened on 26<sup>th</sup> November with *mangalacarana* rendered by Dr. Smt. Manju Sundaram. In the holy atmosphere sanctified by the resonance of benediction, Prof. K.D. Tripathi, Advisor, IGNCA, Varanasi delivered welcome address to the assembled guests. In his short speech Prof. Tripathi gave a brief outline of the entire scheme of Kalatattvakosa, summarized the contents of the volumes published so far and introduced the theme of present Seminar.

Chief Guest Prof. Kiran Kumar Thaplyal from Lucknow delivered inaugural address. In his brief lecture Prof. Thaplyal emphasized on the significance and pertinence of interrelation and interdependence of all the disciplines of Indian Art which is very much necessary for the comprehensive knowledge of the same. The student has to realize the exchange of the concepts reflected in the Philosophy, Literature and Arts, only then in-depth study will be meaningful and perfect.

Renowned Art-critic Prof. Rai Ananda Krishna in his presidential lecture remarked that the language of art is suggestive (rather figurative) which can be understood by using the key of *abhipraya* and *pratika*. He pointed out that motif is related with motion. In course of his lecture he discussed the relation between *pratika* and *abhipraya*; and their difference also; sometimes *pratika* becomes *abhipraya* while in some cases *abhiprayas* are used as *pratikas*. According to him *samaya* and *sanketa* frequently discussed in the Agama literature are almost synonymous with *pratika*. In the Agamas the process of offering 64 *upacaras* in the *puja* ritual has been designated as *sanketa*.

The session ended with vote of thanks rendered by Dr. Pranati Ghosal.

The first session was chaired by Prof. Kamal Giri and main speakers of this session were Prof. Rashmikala Agrawala and Prof. K.K. Thaplyal. At first the session coordinator Prof. Manjula Chaturvedi introduced the chair person and speakers of the session before the audience and also gave a short introduction on *Abhipraya*.

First speaker Prof. Rashmikala Agrawala delivered her lecture on *abhipraya*. In her detailed speech Prof. Rashmi discussed (1) the meaning of *abhipraya*, (2) its two varieties, (3) purpose (artistic, religious, communicative, auspicious) of *abhipraya*, (4) its development in various disciplines and (5) manifestation in painting, sculpture, inscription and coinage.

According to Prof. Agrawala at first shape or form comes in existence, discussion of its meaning or intention is a later fabrication. To illustrate her statement she gave example of prehistoric man who created some shapes and forms which were explained later on in various ways. These shapes and forms were taken from our tradition e.g. spinning wheel (one of the vital motif-s) came at first, in later days it was associated with Gandhiji's freedom movement.

Prof. Agrawala presented a survey of pioneer scholars who worked on motif-s as the subject of their thesis, e.g. Arthur Christon, Thompson, Lax Luthy, V.S. Agrawala, etc. With reference to V.S. Agrawala's work, Prof. Rashmi classified the *abhipraya*-s in two varieties, auspicious and inauspicious and told that purpose of these *abhiprayas* were decoration, communication, removal of calamity and invocation of prosperity. In course of her lecture Prof. Rashmi discussed *abhiprayas* referred to in the classical Sanskrit texts viz. the Brhat Samhita, Visnudharmottara Purana, Raghuvamsa, Kumarasambhava, etc.. Later on she told *mahapurusa laksanas* and their *abhiprayas* which were discussed mainly in the Jyotisa texts, Buddhist and Jaina literature and delineated in the Khajuraho painting and sculptures of Mathura railing pillar. She also threw light on the *abhiprayas* which were found in the inscriptions, ringstones and coins.

Prof. Rai Anand Krishna, Prof.P.K. Agrawala, Prof. D.B.Pandey and Prof. K.D. Tripathi gave illuminating comments on this paper.

Next speaker was Prof. K.K.Thaplyal who dilated on *ratna-triratna*. In his precise lecture, Prof. Thaplyal at first defined *ratna*, then focussed on its other shades of meaning, usage in different branches of learning and their purpose. *Ratna* is something which pleases one, which may be used for wearing gems and precious stones. Barahamihira's Ratna-pariksa discusses the quality, size, shape, their source places, their utility and blemishes. In course of his lecture Prof. Thaplyal referred to Harappan culture and told the usage of various types of *ratnas* in that hoary past. In course of his lecture he talked on *ratnas* discussed in Vedic literature, Panini's Grammar, Ramayana, Kautilya's Arthashastra, Brhat Samhita, etc. In that context with a citation from the Caraka Samhita he discussed the medical values of *ratnas* and their use in preparing medicine. In course of his lecture he also discussed *triratna* or *ratna-traya* the trinity of jewels, otherwise naked as *trisarana* referred to in Buddhist and Jaina literature. Prof. Thaplyal also thrown light on *ratna* used as adjective/epithets to mean excellent (e.g. *kanyaratna*, *kaviratna*, *bhisagratna*, etc.). In this context he also discussed *sapta-ratna*, *astaratna*, *nava-ratna*, *caturdasa-ratna* etc. referred to in the Ramayana, Mahabharata, Meghaduta, Raghuvamsa,

Mrcchakatika, etc. Barahamihira enumerated twenty-two *ratnas*, their sources (e.g. oyster, elephant, serpent, bamboo, etc.) shape, size, quality, their utility and effect.

Prof. P.K. Agrawala, Prof. D.B. Pandey, Prof. Majula Chaturvedi participated in discussion. Prof. Kamal Giri in her presidential lecture commented on two papers presented in this session. In the context of *abhipraya* she discussed the importance of varieties of folk-motifs and symbols which are seen in our family rituals and their true import in our social culture.

Second session was chaired by Prof. K.K. Thaplyal and coordinated by Prof. Sitaram Dubey. In this session two papers were presented: Dr. Devangana Desai's *salabhanjika* and Dr. Advaitavadini Kaul's *hamsa*.

Session coordinator Prof. S. Dubey presented Dr. Desai's article on *salabhanjika*, who could not join the Seminar. However, Prof. Dubey summarized the article '*salabhanjika*' and discussed its etymology, various layers of meaning, its development in various disciplines and its manifestation in the Arts. Prof. Dubey also discussed various aspects of *salabhanjika*, i.e. (1) *salabhanjika* as a festival, (2) *dohada*, (3) as an art-motif, and (4) as a statue. While discussing *salabhanjika* as an art-motif he focussed on some related terms i.e. *torana-salabhanjika*, *stambha-salabhanjika*, *sahakarabhanjika*, *dalamalika*, *dipalaksmi*, *anjalikarika*, etc. Prof. P.K. Agrawala and Prof. Balaram Srivastava offered some illuminating comments on this paper.

Next speaker was Dr. Advaitavadini Kaul who delivered a short speech on *hamsa*. She started with different renderings of the word *hamsa* in India and abroad. Starting with the Rgveda *hamsa* is widely discussed in all the disciplines of Indian classical literature and arts. On the basis of Nirukta, Amarakosa and other traditional lexicons, Dr. Kaul discussed etymology and related words of *hamsa* and its various layers of meaning. In course of her lecture, Dr. Kaul focussed on the development of *hamsa* in the Ramayana, Mahabharata, Puranas, Philosophy (esp. Yoga School), Kalidasa's literature, Mrcchakatika, Uttararamacarita, etc. She also discussed the usage of *hamsa* in Indian music (a particular kind of measurement is *hamsa/hamsanada*, *hamsadhvani* is one of the vital ragas) and dance-posture (*hamsa-mudra*). Dr. Kaul also dilated on *hamsa* as an art-motif frequently seen in the temple architecture. Prof. K.K. Thaplyal in his presidential address commented on both the papers. The session ended with vote of thanks by Prof.K.D. Tripathi.

The morning session of 27.11.08 was chaired by Prof. Deenabandhu Pandey. The session coordinator, Dr. Advaitavadini Kaul rendered *mangalacarana* and gave a short

introduction. Speakers of this session were Prof. P.K. Agrawala and Dr. S. Chattopadhyay. Prof. P.K. Agrawala spoke on *pratika*. In this lecture, Prof. Agrawala covered a long range starting from the Rgveda up to the Architectural texts especially the Mayamata, Manasara and the Manasollasa. Different meanings have been provided in the Layers of Meaning. On the basis of Amarakosa and its commentators, he discussed the derivation and etymology of the word *pratika* which comes from the root *-in* to go prefixed by *prati* and followed by the suffix *ikan*. With the citation from the Nirukta (VII.31) and Durgacarya's commentary thereon he explained that the word may also be derived from the root *anc* preceded by *prati* and thus it becomes: *pratyaktam pratigatam bhavati.... Pratyancitam pratigatam prakasasya....* Sayana explained the word *pratika* as *darsana*. By citing from various lexicons he focussed on various meanings i.e. contrary (*pratikula*), part (*ekadesa*), body (*apaghana*), bodily part (*avayava / anga*), etc. A rare meaning lamp (*pradipa*) has been provided in Mahendrasuri's commentary. Later on he explained the development of *pratika* starting with Rgveda. In the RV *pratika* means mouth, face, appearance, look, beginning, an image or symbol. Here Agni is called *ghrtapratika*. Later on, he explained how the concept *pratika* developed in the Brahmana Literature (esp. Sankhayana, Satapatha and Gopatha Br.), Upanisad (more specifically Br.Up) and Sankara's commentary and in the Sutra texts.

In the Epics and Puranas *pratika* occurs to mean representative token or sign, shadow, reflection etc. In the MBh, *supratika* appears as the name of a *diggaja*, but it is difficult to determine that how this meaning is evolved. In course of his lecture he pointed out the usage of *pratika* in the philosophical texts like Vyasabhasya, Brahmasutra and Raghuvamsa, Naisadhacarita, etc. In the Alankara Sastra *pratika* appears to mean a variety of *alankara* (figure of speech). As regards its manifestation in the Arts Prof. Agrawala explained *pratika* as a type of building on the basis of Mayamata, Manasara, Vastusutra Up. And Manasollasa. Prof. K.D. Tripathi, Prof. D.B. Pandey and Prof. K.K. Thaplyal participated in the discussion.

Next speaker was Dr. Sukumar Chattopadhyay who spoke on *dhvaja*, a fundamental concept of Indian Art. Dr. Chattopadhyay in his lecture discussed derivation etymology and focussed on multiple dimensions of *dhvaja*, its martial utility and importance in social and religious life. The word *dhvaja* is derived from the root *-dhvaj* followed by the suffix *ac* meaning progressive movement of something. According to the lexicons some of the synonyms of *dhvaja* are *ketana*, *pataka*, *vaijayanti*, etc. *Dhvaja* (flag) in different situations convey different meanings e.g. capture of *dhvaja* means defeat, half-

most *dhvaja* means distress/death (of king or any national hero), *dhvaja* blowing fully indicates victory and prosperity of the king. In Medical texts *dhvaja* means male organ and in that context, he referred to *dhvaja bhanga*, a disease which is discussed in the Caraka and Susruta Samhita. In course of his lecture Dr. Chattopadhyay mentioned various compounds formed with *dhvaja*. Later on he mentioned its fourteen levels of meaning e.g. banner, flag, flag staff, emblem, symbol, attribute of a deity, male organ, distilled liquor, mark of a yogin, a particular kind of vedic recitation (*dhvajapatha*), mark of identification, etc. He also discussed its usages in the Literature. As regards its manifestation in the Art and Architecture, Dr. Chattopadhyay sought for some suggestions from the experts, who were present in the audience.

Prof. K.K. Thaplyal in his illuminating comments on the same remarked that in the aspect of Art and Architecture, *dhvajastambha* should be incorporated. There are so many *dhvajastambhas* in different temples and to exemplify it he mentioned the name of Basenagar Stone pillar and Heliodorus's Garudadhvaja. At the end Prof. D.B. Pandey gave presidential comments on both the papers.

The valedictory session started at 3 p.m. chaired by Prof. Balaram Srivastava; Prof. Bishwanath Bhattacharya graced the occasion as the chief-guest. At first Prof. K.D. Tripathi summarized all the papers of all the sessions.

Chief guest Prof. Bhattacharya expressed his satisfaction over the activities of IGNCA, Varanasi, discussed the structural scheme of Kalatattvakosa and threw light on some principles of editing. Prof. Bhattacharya in his blessing note inspired all the contributors of Kalatattvakosa to complete their assignment to their earliest possibility.

Prof. Balaram Srivastava in his presidential address raised some fundamental questions regarding the originality of words and the problem of their rendering. What do the *abhipraya* and *pratika* mean? Do they tally with motif and symbols? In that context he mentioned that A.K. Coomaraswamy was the first person who discussed and interpreted symbols and symbolism in Indian context in proper direction.

The programme ended with vote of thanks rendered by Prof. K.D. Tripathi.

**Pranati Ghosal**